Synopsis of the Major Encyclopedias of Traditional Western Music Notation

Markus Lepper



Abstract

The article gives a comparison of six books about traditional western music notation (CWN) which come with an
encyclopedic claim, trying to cover all possible questions on notation in a systematic way. Since these books all
claim to treat the totality of all relevant questions, their tables of contents could be expected to be mere mutual
permutations, but a detailed comparison of themes and topics shows surprising gaps and differences.

Dieser Text ist ein **Parergon** zu der Dissertation "de Linguis Musicam Notare" im Fachbereich 3 der Universität Osnabrück, betreut von Michael Oehler und Hartmuth Kinzler, erschienen im epOs-Verlag, siehe https://www.epos.uni-osnabrueck.de/buch.html?id=150 Zu Referenzzwecken findet sich der DOI dieses Textes unter https://osnadocs.ub.uni-osnabrueck.de

2 The Books Considered 3

1 Introduction

This article gives a comparison of books about traditional Western music notation. This method of writing down music is also called "common Western notation", "conventional Western notation", "CWN" or "bar based notation". It had been started in Western Europe in the seventeenth century, by enhancing the medieval "mensural notation" by bar lines and ties.(Read, 1979, pgs. 110,183)

Today CWN includes all those extensions developed during the last centuries, in classical and romantic Western composition, up to contemporary avantgarde and electro-acoustic music. For sake of shortness, this whole area will simply be called "music notation" in the following.

We look at six published books which come with a more or less *encyclopedic* claim, which try to cover all possible questions on notation in a systematic way. Due to this demand, their actual "tables of contents" could be expected to be mere mutual permutations, and the answers they give to be widely identical. But going into the details of the texts shows different. So these books are natural candidates for a *synopsis*, which is presented with this article.

2 The Books Considered

The works considered here, in chronological order, are Read (1979), Ross (1987), Stone (1980), Vinci (1991), Wanske (1988), and Gould (2011).

All these claim to cover all major issues in modern CWN; the latest calls itself "the definitive guide" in its title. Most of them consist of a first general part, and a second with rules specific for certain families of instruments, including the human voice and electro-acoustics, or certain ensembles, etc. Some, but not all of them, operate with real examples from musical history and existing engravings. Some of them appeared in recent times, some are already forty years old.

All of them are nice to read, but in the end, all these books will (mostly) tell you the same; this motivated us to write this synopsis article. There are only few questions for which different books give contradictory rules; one can assume that these questions are the real interesting ones. Astonishingly, there are still relevant details covered only by one of them; so far with "definitive" and "encyclopedic".

All books are in the English language, except Wanske (1988), which is written in German and has (as far as we know) never been translated. Here a short characterization of these works, in reverse historical order, as they appear in the synopsis table:

Most recent is the book by Gould (2011). It has more than sixhundred pages, treating *engraving* of music. The first half deals with notation in general. The second part treats rules and symbols special for different families of instruments.

In both parts, most rules are about the optical appearance of the notation text. But with many rules, the author gives *reasons* for the rules, nearly always coming out of *execution pragmatics*. Partly, these reasons reach into areas which could be called *semantics of notation*.

The work contains also a chapter dedicated to electro-acoustic music. Since the other works are significantly older, and the last decades brought revolutionary changes, comparison is not very sensible w.r.t this special topic.

The large chapter on *vocal text presentation* (pg. 437 pp.) is unique and left out in this article, especially because it is limited to English lyrics.

The work by Wanske (1988) is an historic important attempt to prepare for a note engraving computer software. While the technological aspects are somehow outdated, the book is still relevant in different respects:

First, the author has led interviews with engravers from big publishing companies to collect, publish and thus preserve their professional knowledge.

Second, aiming at a software solution, the author tries a first *systematic* approach:

- (a) the basic symbols are grouped according to different aspects (internal graphical syntax, constant vs. variable geometry, categories of meaning).
- (b) the rules for combining these basic symbols are also tried to systematize by introducing a notion of "chaining". This is without any doubt the correct approach.
- (c) the author gives mathematical models for selected details, like matrices and derivation rules for basic symbols, possible relations of note heads, calculation of beam angle, calculation of slur contour, etc.

Therefore this book is still a paradigmatic approach to the very complex problem of musical notation. This book is not organized along the different parameters of music, like most others, and like our synopsis table, but the logic of combination and position calculation. Therefore the page references in the table below appear rather scattered.

4 3 Structure of the Tables

The book by Vinci (1991) is comparatively small and focuses on *hand-writing* of music. Nevertheless, the topics (and even partly their sequential order) are the same as in the much larger Gould (2011).

The book by Stone (1980) is special because it explicitly covers hand-writing *and* engraving, and lists differences *explicitly*.

It also consists of a first general part, and a second part specific to families of instruments. Its main focus is on *modern* techniques, but of course the basic is still CWN, as defined above.

The structure is confusing: The second level are chapters, related to major fields like "Pitch", "Rhythm", "Scores". But the organization one level below follows the *names of concepts* in alphabetical order.

Very welcome and unique are some sections with more fundamental discussions from strategical and philosophical view point: About the different possible relations of new music's time organization and traditional metric notation (pg. 82 pp.), about different strategies for using beaming (pg. 114), etc.

The chapter on the *harp* is much more detailed than the rest of the book, it can serve as a hand-book for modern harp playing techniques! Since it is unique, we have ignored this extra material in the synopsis. So we did with the (very valuable) chapter on keyboard reduction.

The book by Ross (1987) comes with a comprehensive survey of the historic developments of music printing, type setting, engraving and stamping, from the fifteenth century up to "contemporary" music typewriters (one is even already electrical!-) and very first computer aided processes. Most of the book is written from the practitioner's point of view; preparatory steps of engraving and layout are described exhaustively, up to interesting details like that "the engraver never has to refer to the manuscript once the plate has been marked".

Gould (2011) frequently refers to Ross (1987); so does Stone (1980), namely to its first edition from 1970.

The work by Read (1979) starts with a short survey on the history of notation, but in its main part again tries to establish a systematic linear order.

It covers hand-writing (as opposed to the rules for engraving) in a dedicated chapter.

It is the only one of all the books which comes with practical notation exercises at the end of each chapter.

It is a very valuable and famous book and covers many aspects which got lost by its successors, which is clearly shown by the lines in the following tables with only one single entry.

3 Structure of the Tables

The following tables list fine-granular questions and topics, and refer to the pages where these are answered/treated in the different books. As a reference we give the number of the page where the explanation *starts*; subsequent page(s) should always be considered. This number refers to the edition from the bibliographic list below, but different editions should not vary surprisingly.

(In parentheses we show the page numbers where a concept occurs en passant in an example, without being bespoken at all, – so it seems taken as understood by the author.)

The list basically follows the sequential arrangement of topics from Gould (2011), because it is the latest publication with the most differentiated structure. We followed her structure in spite of some minor objections we do have (e.g. the topics concerning the general score layout are rather late; "freedom and choice" is extracted from the general discussion of time and tempo; some topics are doubled at different places, and not always in a consistent way). Nevertheless it should not be the function of such a synopsis article to establish an own and totally new sequential order. Some minor of these dislocations have been silently corrected, partly by doubling, as can be seen easily in the first column of page numbers in the tables below.

Indeed, a really adequate index would have to be multi-dimensional, because most questions arise from a combination of different topics. To create such an indexing system would require substantial effort, far beyond such a short survey article. Nevertheless, these tables can be useful:

- First, they may be valuable indexes for finding the answers for given questions when using one or more of these books, and
 - secondly, they show at one glance gaps and special merits of the bespoken publications,
 - and last not least, they can be the starting point for a more systematic approach.

Currently all question involving more than one concept require multiple table look-up, e.g. if you don't find the topic "dotted rests" under "rests", you must look under "dottings"; for "accidentals of chords" look under "chords" and "accidentals", etc.

The wording and spelling of notions, questions and topics have been taken from the book coming first in the list. Eg., Gould (2011) writes says "stave" and "staves", not "staff", and so we overtook this spelling. She writes "ledger lines", vs. Stone (1980) "leger lines", and "tails", vs. Read (1979) "flags". She spells "notehead" and "barline" in one word, vs. "note-head" in Read (1979). All this we took over.

We did not follow her in taking the word "bar" for the time duration between two "barlines" (see the usage on pg. 41), and follow Read (1979) who insists that the only correct word for this time section is "measure", while "bar" is just a synonym for "barline" (pg. 184).

We tried to cover the first and general parts of all books *completely*, while aiming at a sensible level of granularity. In the second, specific parts we were *very selective* and considered only the topics of general interest. We *completely left out* the chapters on piano reduction and on lyrics in vocal music.

4 Table of General Topics

This first table refers to the general topics. We tried to be exhaustive, with a reasonable level of granularity.

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Strategic dimension: Different roles and functions of notation. Different levels of complexity due to style/epoche/genre/instruments etc.	xi-xiv	58, 83-5, 272 4, 310-5 85-94	- x	xv-xvi, 108 10, 316 108-10	3-	3, 309, 451-3
Graphic Basics: Rastral numbers	483	96	2		57-8, A28	
Fundamental graphical measures/distances in notation	5, 557, 481-2 487-9	,95-97, 259-61		44-5	56, 61, 74-5 143-4	5,
What are the main kinds of staves and their role? changing to unpitched notes midways	5	102	1, 3-6	22-3 22, 79	58, 189-90	27-9
 horizontally incomplete staves staves ending not with a	489-90					31-2, 39-41 313
barline change of instrument	510, 530-1 559	,			206	441-2
What are the tone-defining/tone-less clefs						
 and where are they positioned vertically ? and where are they posi-		45-6, 102-3	7-8	56-7	165-6, 173 144	51-5, 364, 423
tioned horizontally? and for which instruments are they used?	7			72-3		53-5, 293, 303, 338-40, 354-6
Should a clef <i>change</i> be positioned						554-0
at the start of a piece? w.r.t. line breaks? w.r.t. barlines? w.r.t. repeat lines?	7 7 8 234	254-5 254-5	9	46, 57 46, 57	59, 167-8 167	
w.r.t. groupings of notes/phrases? w.r.t. groupings of	8				167	58
pauses? w.r.t. tied notes? w.r.t. beams?	9 23					
¿1 clef in 1 stave clef on a space, not a line					166	59, 355

O	G 11	kar 1	la ze	la.	b	lo 1
Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Noteheads						
shape and orientation	9-13	'	11-12	30-1, 219		29, 63-5
size	10	36		20.1		(406) 75
Cross/diamond noteheads,	11-2			30-1		(406), 75
shape, size and orientation Triangular noteheads	12-3			31, 65, 294		405-6
Proposed alternatives				51, 05, 271	47, A53-5	32-4, 72, 75-7
Basic durations of note		63-4	11, 27			65
symbols						
Stem direction (single note-	13-4	106-7	23	49-50	83	64
head)						
Stem length	14-5	41-2, 101,	,12	47-9	83	64-7
		187-9				
when notehead outside	14-5		24		86	66-7
stave when stem points out of	14	188		47-8	87	
stave (>1 part)	1 T	100		' ' '	07	
Invisible stems for whole	50, 119, 226-	167-8, 173	,64	6, 37	138, 150	237
notes	7, 491	207, 231				
Common cross-stave stems				162-3		
for ensemble						
Dimensions and positions of	15-6	41-2	13-14	1	127	67, 79-80
flags(tails)						
conflicting with ledger	16					
line						
Position of flag enlarges	16	106	14	49		67-7,80
stem						
beams						
size; appearance; rela-	17-8	28-942-3	14, 43-46	9-10	88	80-1, 83
tion to stem and stave						
of fractional beams	17	162 7 105 7	47	12	124	84
affecting stem length Position of horizontal beams	18-9, 21 17-8	163-7, 195-7 25-6, 42, 161		48-9 9-10	101, 117, 125 118, 122, 125	
w.r.t the stave-lines?	17 0	25 0, 42, 101	13 4	7 10	110, 122, 123	
Position of beams with note-	19, 21	161	(43-4)		126	66-7
heads on ledger lines						
Degree of beam angle (pos-	19-24	26, 155-63	,45-6	10-12	97, 115	88
sibly =0)?	24.5	398-400			117	
in case of chords? Stem direction with beams?	24-5 24-25	154-5, 194-6		50	117 94	88
Position of angled beams	20-21		47	10-11	98, 120, 125	
w.r.t the stave-lines?					A52	1
Beams outside stave (>1	21	26, 161		12		
part)	2.5					
Beams split for graphic/interval reasons	25					86
split/sub-divided for se-	169-70	169, 193-5				85, 306
mantic/execution reasons	105 70	105, 155 5				03, 300
Opposite stem direction on		I	ı	1	T	ı
the same beam		i		1	ı	
in one(1) line?	26	125 102 4		13-14	126	88-9, 307-8
in two(2) lines, e.g. in piano system?	314-7	135, 193-4		12-14	127	(70), 86, 307- 8
piano system?		1	I		1	8

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Beams across rests	36, 164-5		(16), 49	15	(176)	3,102
Beamed rests / stemlets	165-6		49	15-16, 28	163	93
Beams for varying speed	140, 158			4, 124, 141		94
Dimensions of ledger lines with chords and overlapping parts	26 27	30, 50-1	10	30	182	43, 422
with chords containing second intervals	27		10		182	
Octave signs, orthography, placement, extension lines, w.r.t. line breaks	28-31	276		25, 44	173, 203	45-7, 422-3
Octavating clefs coll 8va When to use octavation vs. ledger lines / in score vs. parts	32 32 32-4, 255			56-7		55-6 47-8, (230) 47, 57-8
Rests , design and size vertical placement (1 part per stave)	34-5 35, 38	43-5, 104	15-7 15-7		173 173, 178	96, 103, 424 (96)
vertical placement (¿1 part) sharing when ¿1 part	36-38 37, 312, 528	170-1	16-7		176	97, 99-100 (342-3)
2	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	ı	I			()
Geometry of barlines of different kinds	38-9	28, 65, 103-4 120	50	6-9	74, 151	182-5, 312-3, 425
anti-aligned positioning between staves, not crossing them	489		52	8	59	215
Dotted barlines for meter subdivision	178			8		217, 312-3
Rhythmic horizontal spacing	39-41, 200-2	97-100, 108- 127, 203-5 264-8, 277-80	,	46-7, 135-6	73	96, 425
Adjust spaces of changing stem direction General horizontal spacing rules (order, spacing)	41	108, 135-7 194			77	
between clef, key signature, time signature at beginning of line etc.	41-2	128-32, 254-7	779	44-6	144	
around those, in the mid- dle of line	42-3	128-32		46		
accidentals and note spacing		128-33, 198- 202		45-6	146	
Alignments of notes(objects) in parallel lines	490-1	109, 143-154 256-7	,25	47		71
Horizontal spacing, general pragmatic considerations		263-4			73, A2, A6	
Vertical spacing, general pragmatic considerations	487-8, 523-5	268-74			60, A6	

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
(Cingle stammed) should						
(Single-stemmed) chords stem direction	47-8	189-90	24	50	84, 150	69
			24	50		
Chords containing a second	48-9	172-4	25		149-50	71
interval	40	1.50			(4.50)	
Chords containing more	49	172-4			(150)	
than one second intervals						
Aligned octaves (also for ac-	90	199, 202				(136)
cidentals)						
Aligning chords with sec-	49	174	25		150	71
onds, anti-stemmed						
Single-stemmed unisons	50			78		
Single-stemmed unisons	50-2					73-4, 90
with alteration (eg. cluster)						
Cluster	326-9			57-63, 259-60		74-5, 299,
						320-2, 408
		1	1	1	I	1 /
Double-stemmed writing						
Unisons sharing noteheads	52	177		78, (165-5)	204	68-9, 343-4
Unisons with separate note-			26	78		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
heads / seconds				, ,		
Overlapping/crossing parts	53-4	175-6	26	164-5		342-3
with two stemless notes	54	175 0		1013		312 3
Detailed discussion of off-	310-3	175-85				70-1, 305-6,
setting conflicts in free key-	510-5	173-63				308-10
board writing						300-10
		198				
Crossing of beams and		198				
stems, since parts¿2						
Dotted notes						
meaning		60-1	39	1	1	113-4, 116-7
•	51 5	118-9	40		169-71	113-4, 110-7
positioning with single	34-3	116-9	40		109-71	114-3, 424
notes	55 (4.1		160.70	115 424
positioning with chords	33-6		41		169-70	115, 424
and seconds						
with double-stemmed						
writing		1	I		1	1
	56-7	177, 185-7	40-1	125-6, 164-5		69, 115
double-stemmed with	57-8	187				
seconds / overlap / both						
Dotted unisons – single	58-60	177, 186	40-1	78, 125-6		69
stem, double-stem, cluster						
Dots crossing barlines (e.g.						117
Brahms)						
Dotted rests			•			•
visual appearance	38	105	42		179	102, 119-20
metric usage	161-4		18-23	134-5	170, 179-80	101, (102)
-	1	1	1	1	1	1

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Ties		1	'	1	1	
geometry and position	60-1	29, 48-9, 230- 2	60-1	36-7	136-40, 142	110-1
between enharmonics Tie direction and placement	60	231	61		136	111
for single notes	62, 64	231-2	60-1		137-40	111
together with articula-	62, 122			43	142	
position with duration	63-4				139	113
dots						
and line breaks		276	61-2	37-9	60	
for chords	63-6	84, 206, 232	62-4	40-1, 167	138-9	112
for double-stemmed	67-70		62-3	39, 167	139	113, 344
writing						
plus overlap(crossing)	67					
with ledger lines	68					
with unisons	69-70					
Ties with moving chords	70-1	206		41	138	268
Ties crossing stems	63, 67-8	200		71	130	113
•						122, 369
Open ties, <i>laissez vibre</i> , Pfte Pedal	72-3, 337					122, 309
Ties graphically in two(2) parts	68, 72, 133					122
Dotted lines for ties (with	225, 338		95	35-6	173	123, 391
tremolo, etc)						
		1	L	Î	i	i .
_	77-8	43, 81, 105	69-70	46, 53	130-1	125-9, 424-5
placement						
Scope (affected by change of	79-81		72-5	53-5, 166		129-32
clef, octave, stave, voice)						
Alternative scoping prac-	86-7			55-6		
tices (e.g. dodecaphonic)						
Spelling chromatic scales	85		73			
· •	85					
in non-tonal contexts						
Accidentals and ties / over	80-1	276	74	54-5		131
barline / over line break	00 1	270	/ -	5+ 5		131
	81-2		71	54		
Cautionary accidentals	82-3		72-5	55		129-30
Accidentals and grace notes			12-3	55		129-30
_	84	246		75.6		222 4 246
Accidentals for ornaments	84-5	246	75.0	75-6		233-4, 246
Accidentals for chords	87-90	198-202	75-9		131-5	133-5
including seconds	90	201-2			132-5	134-5
Accidentals in double-	90-1				134	134-5
stemmed writing						
Symbols for Quarter-Tones	94-6, 98			67-9		145-6
Symbols for other Micro-	96-7			70		
Tones						
		1	1	1	1	1
Key signatures						
design and placement	91-2	81, 254	69-70,79-81		144-7, 168	135-8
	92-3	254-6	79-81 /			139-40
lation, also at line breaks			,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		168	10
Key signatures in modern	03_4				100	141-5
)J- 4					171-3
style (polytonal/new keys)						126
Key signatures doubling oc-						136
taves		1	I		1	

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Dynamic symbols, design	101-8	46-7, 238-45	86-8	16-7, 31-2	185-7, 205	250-4
and placement						
"niente" / "al niente"	108			18		
indicated by size of note-				18		256
head						
indicated by tabulatura						257
notation						257
indicated by numbers	107			10		257
"subito" symbol/text cresc. and dim. hairpins	107 103-6	239-45	88	19	187-8	255
Hairpins and line break	103-6	239-43	00		60, 188	251, 253-5 255
Open hairpins	104, 107	275			188	255 255
cresc. and dim. distributed	104, 107	273			100	250, 253
text version	100					230, 233
Additional qualifying text	106					251
raditional qualifying text	100		I			231
Slurs						
different semantics, de-	109			35		265-6
pending from context						
1	109-11	48-9	64	36-7	139-143	266-7
(1 part)						
curve calculation		47-9, 210-30	,			
		400-10				
1	111		66		(140)	347
ends (¿1 part)						
w.r.t. staves	110	226	67.0	12.4	120 20 142	110 1 260 71
w.r.t. other articulations	121-2		,67-8	42-4	129-30, 142	110-1, 269-71
11: 1 1	112	231, 236-8		27.0		
and line break	112	274-5	66	37-9	141.0	266
on tied notes	62,113	70-1, 206	,63	37-9 41	141-2	266
C shamed alum	(221)	236-7, 275			1.42	
S-shaped slur Nested / connected slurs	(321) 113	208-9, 410		35-6, 39	143	273
Dotted slurs	113			35-0, 39		272-3, 348
Slurs on chords	114	206-7	67	39, 41, 167	140	267-8
orars on choras	111	200 /	07	55, 11, 107	110	207 0
Articulation marks						
different kinds and their	114-6		,82-5	4-6	128-30, 210	
meaning		75-6				348-9, 376-7,
						402-4
Schoenberg stress marks	115		82-3	4-5		271
Repeated articulation / sim-	116		53	33		
ile	117.01	222.6	0.4.7	_	100 00 171 0	2064
Placement (stem or note-	117-21	232-6	84-5	5	128-30, 171-2	264
head) in double-stemmed writ-	117 0		84			(2.42)
	117-8		04			(342)
ing together with seconds	119	209				
together with seconds		207	1			I
Grace Notes and Appog-						
giatura						
design and placement	125-7	52, 107, 246-	-91	21-2, 42, 49	190-1	89-90, 238-41
-		7		51		
alignment (with barli-	127-8					239
nes/in parallel parts)						
·	128-9					241
beat						1

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Arpeggiated chords						
<i>U</i> ,	131-2			3-4	198-9	242-3
cation	100.0					2.42
changing dynamics dur-	132-3					243
ing arpeggio	122 4			4		241.2
spelled-out arpeggios,	133-4			4		241-2
with ties over gaps				4		
changing speed				4		
Ornament symbols		46, 58-9, 64				245-7
Ornament symbols		5, 245-6				2-13-1
Trills		p, 2.3 0	I		I	I
symbols and placing	134-6	245	92	74-5	197	67, 232-5
Trill lines	136-7	246	92-3	25, 75	197	233-4
and line breaks	137	246, 275		77		
Starting and finishing notes	138		93-4	75, 77		233
Specifying the trilling pitch	138-9		93	75-6	197	233
Timbral trills				77		
Varying speed	139-40					
		1	1	1	I	1
Glissando, symbol, addi-	140-4			19-21, 63	198	243-4, 326-9
tional text and placement	1.40			20. 64		374-6, 397-8
Portamento (= short glis-	140			20, 64		
sando)	1.40					
	142					
breaks, clef changes, accidentals						
with unspecified start or	142-3			20, 64		244
end	142-3			20, 04		2-7-7
starting/ending midway	144					
in note duration	1					
with start/intermedi-	144-5			64		
ate/end notes						
over composite duration	145-6			21		73
with articulation	146					
with contour line	146			20-1, 64		
Vibrato, indicated by text	146-7			25, 74, 80,	,	
				304		
with contour line	147			26, 71, 80		
E	102 5 525	207.0	00	22.2	A 40 O	200.1
Expression and performance instructions	492-5, 525. 530	,297-8	90	32-3	A48-9	280-1
mance instructions	330		I			
Time Signatures						
dimension of symbols	151-2	49, 104	(17)	177-83	145, 147	148-50, 157-8
and placing					,	,
intermediate changes,	152	254		46, 146-7	168	157
also at line breaks						
Beaming rules w.r.t. ruling	153-8	168	37-9, 47	12, 110-4	90-2, 127	,81-87
meter					193-4	
further inner grouping	156-7			14, 110, 113		84
fractional beams in dot-	157		47	12		84-5
ted rhythms						
"Rhythmic" vs. "metric"		169		114		91-2
beaming, discussion of						
concepts	150			110 115 117		00.2
Beams crossing barlines Whole-measure rests	158 159-60	65, 122	17	112, 115, 117 45, 47, 135-6		90-3 97-8
Whole-measure notes	41	66, 121-3			78	21-0
WHOIC-INCASUIC HOLES	71	144	,	73, 77, 133	, 0	
	1	1	I	I	I	I

Question/Topic Gould Wanske Vinci Stone Ross Read							
Notes across the beat /		Gould	Wanske				
Notes across the heart	Grouping of rests w.r.t. me-	160-4		18-23, 39	133-6	174-6, 178-81	99-101
iics vs. syspncopations content of the content							
Cross metrics / difference playing vs. writing by accents/brackets/(dotted barlines)/brackets/(dotted		166 9 170 1	I	20 47	111 146	02 102 4	121.2
Cross metrics / difference playing vs. writing by accents/brackets/(dotted barlines)/bearning 171-2	• •	100-8, 170-1		39, 47		/	
Palying vs. writing by accents/brackets/(dotted barlines)/beaming 171-2			I	I	140	175	03, 110 121
17-2 115-9 91-3, 170-2, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-1, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 217 170-2, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 2	•						
Note sequence without time signatures Dual time signatures Interchangeable meters meters of variable stress / alternating meters / compound meters		171-2			115-9		91-3, 170-2,
Signatures Dual time signatures / interchangeable meters meters of variable stress / alternating meters / compound meters Non-power-2 as denominators Fractional numerators/de-nominators Polymeter with coinciding barlines 172-4, 178-80 180-1 179-80 175-7 177-85 175-7 177-85 179-80 175-7 177-85 179-80 175-7 177-85	•						217
Dual time signatures / inter- changeable meters meters of variable stress / alternating meters / compound meters Non-power-2 as denominators Non-power-2 as denominators Noteheads as denominators 180-1 182 175-7 170-1 1		609-12					
Changeable meters meters of variable stress / alternating meters / compound / comp	•	172 4 179 90			115		150 70 172 7
National Stress alternating meters / compound meters 180-1 180		172-4, 176-60	,		113		136-70, 173-7
180-1 180-	_						
179-80 189-80 189-90 189-90 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 183-185-7 199-302 199							
Noteheads as denominators Fractional numerators/denominators Fractional numerators/denominators Polymeter with coinciding barlines Polymeter with coinciding barlines 174-5 175-7, 577 177-8, 577-8, 577-8, 177-8, 577-8, 177-8, 577-8, 177-8, 577-8, 577-8, 177-8,	Non-power-2 as denomina-	180-1					
Fractional numerators/denominators Polymeter with coinciding barlines with shifting barlines Polymeter with coinciding barlines Polymeter with coinciding barlines with shifting barlines Polymeter with coinciding barlines Polymeter with coinciding barlines Polymeter with coinciding 175-7, 577 177-8, 577-8, 614-6 Common enlarged time signature \$17, 519-20 Conductor signs/metronome marks/synchronization events Tempo indication 182-4, 492 289-90, 297 89 32, 145-6, A8, A46-7 276 Retronomic tempo indication 183 89 128, 164 A45 276-80 Tempo gradually changing Tempo equation 184-5 89-90 127-8 158, 167, 280 Caesura and Comma Fermata on notes and barlines General Pause 190 49, 257-8 90 43, 128 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 106 Tuplets using simple numbers where to put the tuple indication horizontally by proportion indication sum duration without simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket in praellel parts 179-5 177-8 119-22 177-8 177-8 119-22 177-8 177-8 119-22 177-8 177-8 177-8 119-22 177-8 185 128-9 276-80 184-5 276-80 187 276-80 187 276-80 188 128-9 105-6 187 128-9 208-9 106-7 187 187-90 208-9 106-7 187 187-90 208-9 106-7 187 187-90 208-9 106-7 188 189 128-9 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 189 208-9 106-7 189 208 208 208-9 106-7 189 208 208 208 208 189 208 208 208 208 189 208 208 208 208 189 208 208 208 208 189 208 208 208 208 189 208 208 208 208		100					170.00
Nominators							
Polymeter with coinciding barlines barlines 174-5 175-7, 577 177-8, 577-8, 614-6 177-83 165 171-5 177-8 179-10		180					1/3-/
barlines with shifting barlines Poly-tempo		174-5					170-1
Poly-tempo	•						
Common enlarged time signature 517, 519-20 Conductor signs/metronome marks/synchronization events 179, 617-21 159-62 177-8 159-62 177-8 177-8	with shifting barlines				1		171-5
177-83	Poly-tempo		,		119-22		
Tempo indication 182-4, 492 289-90, 297 89 32, 145-6, A8, A46-7 276		614-6		177.02		1.67	
159-62 177-8 178				1 / /-83		165	
Tempo indication 182-4, 492 289-90, 297 89 32, 145-6, A8, A46-7 276 164 164 183 89 128, 164 A45 276-80 184-5 183, 185-7 89 127-8 158, 167, 280 127-8 158, 167, 280 127-8 158, 167, 280 128-9 1		179, 617-21			159-62		177-8
Tempo indication		,					
Metronomic tempo indication Tempo gradually changing Tempo equation 183 184-5 183, 185-7 185 187 187-90 187-90 187-90 187-90 187-90 188-5 188-5 188-90 127-8 128-9 105-6 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 208-9 106 187 190 190 190 190 190 100 187 190 190 100 100 100 100 100 10	events						
Metronomic tempo indication Tempo gradually changing Tempo equation 183 184-5 183, 185-7 185 187 187-90 187-90 187-90 187-90 187-90 188-5 188-5 188-90 127-8 128-9 105-6 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 208-9 106 187 190 190 190 190 190 100 187 190 190 100 100 100 100 100 10	Tomno indication	192 4 402	200 00 207	len	22 145.6	A	h76
Metronomic tempo indication Tempo gradually changing Tempo equation 183 89 128, 164 A45 276-80 279 184-5 183, 185-7 89 127-8 127-8 158, 167, 280 Caesura and Comma Fermata on notes and barlines General Pause 190 187 190 49, 257-8 90 43, 128 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 208-9 106 Tuplets using simple numbers 193-4 302 28-32 27-9, 121, 159-64 187 129-32 in compound time where to put the tuple indication horizontally by proportion indication sum duration without simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts	rempo maication	182-4, 492	289-90, 297	89		,Ao, A40-7	276
Tempo gradually changing Tempo equation	Metronomic tempo indica-	183		89		A45	276-80
Caesura and Comma Fermata on notes and bar-lines 187 187-90 49, 257-8 90 91 128-9 208-9 105-6 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 208-9 106 Tuplets 190 28-32 27-9 121, 159-64 187 129-32 164 188 188 193-4 300 29-30 161-1, 164 194, 212-5 132 218-9 132-3							
Caesura and Comma Fermata on notes and barlines General Pause 190 187 187-90 49, 257-8 90 43, 128 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 208-9 106 Tuplets using simple numbers 193-4 302 28-32 27-9, 121, 159-64 187 129-32 in compound time where to put the tuple indication horizontally by proportion indication sum duration without simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket using simple numbers 204-7 31-33 30 29-30 164 188 187 129-32 164 188 194-212-5 132 218-9 132-3 132-	, ,						
Semata on notes and bar-lines 187-90 49, 257-8 90 43, 128 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 208-9 106	Tempo equation	183, 185-7		89	127-8		158, 167, 280
Semata on notes and bar-lines 187-90 49, 257-8 90 43, 128 173, 184-5, 106-7 208-9 208-9 106	Caesura and Comma	187		91	128-9	208-9	105-6
190 208-9 208-9 106 208-9 208-9 106 208-9 208-9 208-9 106 208-9 208-9 106 208-9 208-9 106 208-9			49, 257-8				
Tuplets using simple numbers			,				
using simple numbers 193-4 302 28-32 27-9, 121, 159-64 187	General Pause	190				208-9	106
using simple numbers 193-4 302 28-32 27-9, 121, 159-64 187	7D 1.4						
in compound time where to put the tuple indication horizontally by proportion indication sum duration without simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 129-32 130-32 164 188 194-5, 193-4 207-8 208 208 208 208 208 209 30 26-9, 41 160-3 212-3	-	103 4	202	hg 32	b7 0 121	150 64	197
in compound time where to put the tuple in- dication horizontally by proportion indication sum duration without simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 31-33 30 29-30 164 161-1, 164 194, 212-5 218-9 218-9 31-33 30 29-30 218-9 218-9 218-9 218-9 218-9 218-9 218-9 218-9 218-9	using simple numbers	193-4	302	26-32		,139-04	107
dication horizontally by proportion indication sum duration without simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 132 218-9 132 132 218-9 208 132-3 212-3	in compound time	204-7		31-33		164	188
by proportion indication sum duration without simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 207-8 208-9 208 132 218-9 218-9 218-9 218-9 208 132-3 212-3	where to put the tuple in-	193-4		30	29-30	161-1, 164	194, 212-5
simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 208-9 132-3 132-3 160-3 212-3							
simple equivalent (e.g. 5/8) by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 132-3 208 132-3 26-9, 41 160-3 212-3	* 1 1				132		218-9
by "number per duration" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 194-5, 199-302 30 26-9, 41 160-3 212-3		208-9					
tion" whether and where to put a bracket aligning of brackets in parallel parts 194-5, 199-302 200 196		208			132-3		
whether and where to put a bracket 200 196 26-9, 41 160-3 212-3 212-3 212-3 212-3 25-9 200 26-9, 41 26-9, 41 26-9, 41 26-9 212-3		200			132 3		
aligning of brackets in parallel parts		194-5, 199-	302	30	26-9, 41	160-3	212-3
parallel parts	•						
		196					
aligic of olderets 170-7 101		106.7				161	
	aligic of ofacacts	170-7	1	1	I	101	

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Where to put the tuplet symbols vertically	197-9		30	27, 42	159-50	
together with slurs	198			27	159, 162	
in double-stemmed writ-	199				159	
ing						
in relation to the stave	199					
2	200-2	149-53	28-31			187-211
rhythms with tuplets Beaming and grouping in tu-	210-3			27-9		213-4
plets	210-3			21-9		213-4
Tuplets crossing barlines	210			112		220
Omitting repeating numerals	215				163	214-5
Two traditions of nested tu-	203-4, 214		34	130-1		189-90
plets / quadratic tuplets						210.20
Tuplets starting off-beat Hemiola				112 129		219-20
пеннога				129		
Tremolos						
One note tremolos						
meaning	219-21, 224	66-7	94-5	148-50	200	393-4
symbol dimensions and	221-3		94			
placing	222				162 172	
carrying articulation symbols	223				163, 172	
over tied notes	225		95	149		123, 391
Two note tremolos		1	7-	1- 12	I	,
meaning	225-6	67-8	96	74, 76, 149	-199-200	235-8, 330,
				51		394-7
symbol dimensions and	226-7	117-8, 167-8	96			235
placing with opposite stem di-	226-7			151		237
rection	220-7			131		237
with stemless notes	226		96			237
across two (keyboard)	227			151		
staves						
horiz. alignment of sec-	227	148		151		238
ond note with parallel parts over tied notes	229					123
in varying speed	22)			124		123
··· /		1	I			I
Repetitions						
Short Repetitions:		1	I	la a	I	la a a
repeated beats	230-1		57	33	202	223-4
Repeated chords Repeated measures	231 231-3, 578-9		57 55-6	33 33-4	202 173, 202	224-5, 228
Repeated measures	586	,	55-0	33-4	173, 202	224-3, 228
Long Repetitions:		I	I	I		I
repeat symbols	233-4		,50-1	34	147	185, 226-7
		254-5				
prima e seconda volta	233-4, 236-7	258-9	51	34	60, 194-5	226
endings measure numbering	237 240	299		168-9		
methods	237, 240	299		100-9		
with changes of clef,	234-5	254				227
time signature and key						
and scope of intensity di-	235					
rectives, etc.	225					228
with small variations per repetition	235					228
dal segno / da capo verbal	238-40	49, 257-8	58-9	34-5	60, 173, A8-9	228-9
jump instructions					.,,,	
	•	•	•	•	•	•

5 Table of Topics Specific for Families of Instruments or Types of Notation

The following table refers to the **topics specific** for certain families of instruments or types of notation documents. Again, we follow the order of Gould (2011).

In contrast to the class of general topics in the preceding section, here we *do not include* the topics which are *too specific* to be of general interest (e.g. different stopping techniques for brass or different ways of knocking on the corpus of a harp !-). We collect only those topics which are also of general interest, which is at about the half of all material.

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Brass/Woodwind		1	I	I	1	1
Flutter tongue	247			25, 188		349
Transposition/enharmonic	251-3, 505-6			71-3, 199-20	20	340-2, 356
<u> </u>		',		71-3, 199-20	<i>.</i>	340-2, 330
simplification	545			102		
Harmonics/Multiphonics	257-8			192	_	2.50
Mutes/Stops	263-4			162, 19 200-2	25,	359
				200-2		
Percussion						
Symbols for instru-	275			206-13		366, 378
ments/beaters						
Relation of staves/lines/in-	276-7		8	215-6		
struments/players/hands						
Two note tremolos (simpli-	278					
fied notation for Marimba						
etc.)						
Different forms of noteheads	282			219		365
for instruments	202			219		303
Non-standard staves	283-4			23, 215		363, 368
	289			23, 213		303, 306
Dry instrument rhythms	289-92					260
Laissez-vibrer and damping				220		369 274 5
Timpani glissandi	296			221 2 225		374-5
Drum rolls	297			221-2, 225		371, 373
Keyboard						
(partly also for Harp, Guitar,						
Marimba, etc)						
Stave layout						
(four hands/two keyboards/-	329-32	1	1	257-9	155	30-2, 300-2
more than 2 staves)	327 32			2317	133	312
Relation of staves/instru-	303.4	191-3				301-2
ments/hands	303-4	191-3				301-2
Stem direction for hand allo-	205 6	101 7 209				202 4 206
	303-0	191-7, 208				303-4, 306
cation	206.7			260.1		202
Hand crossing/identifica-	306-7			260-1		302
tion, by text or brackets	207					210
Voice leading lines (also in	307					218
ensemble score)						
Unisons sharing noteheads	307-8					308-10
Unisons with black	307-8	177				309
(beamed) and white note- head (also guitar!)						

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Tied notes across staves	308			273		311
Fingering	308-9	302-4			196-7	316
Finger substitution	309					310
Omitting (minimizing num-	317-19, 311-3	3				307
ber of) rests						
Placing tuplet indication	319-20					
Slurs across staves	321-2	208-9				314-5
Slur crossing slur		209				315
Placing dynamics	323-4	210		31	186-7	252, 254, 313
putting shared dynamics	323	209, 241-2		31	186	252
between staves						
Placing octave signs	324-5					
Glissandi	326					
Pianoforte						
pedaling	332-7	I	1	25, 269-72	201	317-9
Silently depressed keys	338			261-2, 272	201	317-9
Catch Reverberation	338			272		319
Harmonics	339			261-2		
Playing inside the piano	339-341			262-9		322
Preparation	341-2			202)		322
Treparation	311 2	1		I	I	
Organ: stave layout	342-4	250-1		6, 274	155	35, 183, 303,
- 8						312
manual, coupling and	344-7			277-80		
register indication						
rhythmic registration				279-80		
pedal marks	347-8			278	201	316-7
Held and released key nota-				274-6		
tion						
Mechanically held keys	348			276-7		
		1	1			
Harp : relation of staves and	351-2					
hands						
tuning and enharmonic	352-4			244-5		324-6
spelling	2.50			226.0		220.0
crossing and parallel	358			236-9		328-9
glissandi	250			2.42		220
pedal glissandi harmonics	359 366			243 239-40		329 331-2
narmonics	300			239-40		331-2
Guitar: strings and finger-	373-6	I	1		196-7	
ing	373 0				150 7	
harmonics	384-8					
scordatura	388-9					
		1	ı	I	1	I
Strings: string indication	394					386, 392
bariolage	395-6					390
fingering	396					
double-stopping	396-8			310		384, 390
triple- and quadruple-	398-9			309-10		384, 389-90
stopping						
using two staves	399-400					
bowing marks	405				200	401
pizzicato	408-12			312-4		391, 399-401
harmonics	413-24			311-2		385-9
scordatura	424-5					202
Avoid double crosses			1			392

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Vocals: staves' layout and clefs	433, 462-4				156-7	287-93
position of dynamics/articulation/expr. marks	434			32, 295	187	252, 296-7
syllabic beaming	435	169, 306		293		293-5
syllabic slurs / place-				296-7		297
ment						
placing text	437-54	304-9		299-301	79-80, 187	425
speech notation,	456-60			1 '	,206-8	72-3, 298-9
"Sprechstimme"				304-5		
General Score Topics						
Measure numbers	484, 490	299-302		168-70		184, 445
Rehearsal Marks	484-6			168	A8	184, 443-4
Between Movements	486-7					
Principal Part (Schoenberg)	496			17-8		282-3
Vi-De ossia	496 497					67-8
Orchestra score order	511-13	251-3		170-2		07-8
Separating/marking instru-	514-521	247-51	4-6	6-8	155-7	35-7, 183,
mental sections graphically	31.321	2.7.31			133 ,	422
Instrument labelling	507-10	296-7			A32-3	434-5
System dividers ("//")	521	249				
First page shows all instru-	521-2	284-5		170		435
ments of this movement						
Stave sharing/divided		-280-4				342-3, 448-9
strings (also in parts)	8, 584-6					
Parts						
multiple rests	564-5, 580	287	17	136	177-8	102, 104-5,
naga turna	152 192	272 200		46, 143-4	A3-5	414, 444 442-3
page turns	452, 482 559-62	,272, 288		40, 143-4	A3-3	442-3
abbreviations must be	337 02	287				
resolved						
cues	566-77	107, 288-9	92	49, 51, 71	,189	439-40
				160-1		
Clusters by ensembles,				58-60		
spelled out in parts						
Electroacoustic Music						
What to specify in a preface	591					
Roles and function of nota-	592			316		
tion						
Starting/stopping playback	592-3, 602-3			320		
tracks	502 5 500			217.20		
Notation of played-back				317-20		
contents for synchronizing (pitch cues, graphical, pro-	002					
portional, text description)						
Dynamics for electronic	598-9					
sounds						
Keyboard controlling sam-	601-2					
ples						
Delay lines	603					
Program changes Continuous controllers	604					
Commuous controllers	604-6	1	1			

References 17

Question/Topic	Gould	Wanske	Vinci	Stone	Ross	Read
Freedom and choice						
Cadenzas and ad libitum	610-12					
passages						
Independent parts / explicit	613-21					
(re-)synchronization						
Independent repetition	621-8			24, 154-7		
Free placing in a defined	628-9			156-7		220-1
time-span						
Proportional spacing	39, 594-5	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		24, 96-103	3,	72
	629-634,			122, 136-45		
	636-7					
for sustained notes and	632-4			26, 71, 223		
glissandi						
Approximate pitch	640-2			66, 70-1		
Choices and alternatives	643-9			152-4, 155-6		
Choices from dynamic				17, 153		
ranges						
(Purely) graphical notation				103-7		

References

Gould, E. (2011). Behind Bars: the Definitive Guide to Music Notation. Faber, London.

Read, G. (1979). Music Notation: a Manual of Modern Practice. Taplinger, New York.

Ross, T. (1987). The Art of Music Engraving and Processing. Hansen Books, New York.

Stone, K. (1980). Notation in the Twentieth Century: a Practical Guidebook. Norton, New York.

Vinci, A. C. (1991). Die Notenschrift: Grundlagen der traditionellen Musiknotation. Bärenreiter, Kassel.

Wanske, H. (1988). Musiknotation – Von der Syntax der Notenstichs zum EDV-gesteuerten Notensatz. Schott, Mainz.